Case Number: ZC-19-092

ZONING MAP CHANGE
STAFF REPORT

City Council Meeting Date: June 25, 2019

Zoning Commission Recommendation:
Approval by a vote of 8-0

Opposition: None submitted
Support: None Submitted

Owner / Applicant: S. Main ABC, LLC

Site Location: 212 S. Main St.

Proposed Use: Historic Designation

Request: From: “NS-T5/DD” Near Southside Urban Center/Demolition Delay
To: Add “HC” Historic & Cultural Overlay

Land Use Compatibility: Requested change has no effect.

Comprehensive Plan Consistency: Requested change is consistent.

Staff Recommendation: Approval

Background:
The owner requests a recommendation to City Council to consider changing the designation of the property at 212 S. Main Street from Demolition Delay (DD) to Historic and Cultural Landmark (HC).

Eligibility for Designation

The structure meets the following City of Fort Worth criteria for historic designation:

Criterion 1: Is distinctive in character, interest or value, and exemplifies the cultural, economic, social, ethnic or historical heritage of the City of Fort Worth, State of Texas or the United States.

Criterion 2: Is an important example of a particular architectural type or specimen or embodies elements of architectural design, detail, material, or craftsmanship that represent a significant architectural innovation in Fort Worth.

Criterion 5: Bears a significant relationship to other distinctive buildings, structures, sites, objects, or areas, either as an important collection of properties of architectural style or craftsmanship with few intrusions, or by contributing to the overall character of the area according to a plan based on architectural, historic, or cultural motif.
Criterion 8: Is designated as Recorded Texas Landmark or State Archeological Landmark or is included in the National Register of Historic Places.

**Integrity**

Based on the evidence still extant at the property, the property at 212 S. Main Street sufficiently retains seven aspects of integrity.

**Summary**

Staff have found evidence that the property meets 4 of the 8 Criteria for Designation. The property also retains its original integrity and the identity for which it is significant. This is consistent with the requirements of the ordinance for Historic and Cultural Landmark properties.

At the Historic & Cultural Landmarks Commission on April 8, 2019 the HCLC recommended that City Council consider changing the Demolition Delay designation and simultaneously designating the property located at 212 S Main Street as a Historic & Cultural Landmark.

**Site Information:**

Owner: S. Main ABC, LLC  
PO Box 1324  
Fort Worth, TX 76004

Applicant: City of Fort Worth

Acreage: 0.1756 ac

Comprehensive Plan Sector: Southside

**Surrounding Zoning and Land Uses:**

- North “NS-T5” Near Southside Urban Center / industrial
- East “NS-T5” Near Southside Urban Center / industrial
- South “NS-T5” Near Southside Urban Center / vacant
- West “NS-T5” Near Southside Urban Center / industrial

**Public Notification:**

300 foot Legal Notifications were mailed on May 31, 2018.

**Recent Relevant Zoning and Platting History:**

- Zoning History: None
- Platting History: None

**Development Impact Analysis:**

1. **Land Use Compatibility**

   The requested “HC” zoning overlay will not change the base zoning; as a result, there will be no effect on compatibility.

2. **Comprehensive Plan Consistency**

   The 2019 Comprehensive Plan designates the subject property as Mixed Use Growth Center and the overlay district will not affect the underlying zoning district and future land use.

   As a result, the proposed zoning is consistent with the 2019 Comprehensive Plan.

**Attachments:**

- Location Map
- Area Zoning Map with 300 ft. Notification Area
- Future Land Use Map
- Aerial Photograph
- HCLC report
Area Zoning Map

Applicant: S Main ABC LLC
Address: 212 S Main St
Zoning From: NS-T5/DD
Zoning To: Add HC Overlay
Acres: 0.17329415
Mapsco: 77E
Sector/District: Southside
Commission Date: 6/12/2019
Contact: 817-392-2495
A Comprehensive Plan shall not constitute zoning regulations or establish zoning district boundaries. (Texas Local Government Code, Section 213.005.) Land use designations were approved by City Council on March 5, 2019.
REQUEST

The owner requests a recommendation to City Council to consider changing the designation of the property at 212 S. Main Street from Demolition Delay (DD) to Historic and Cultural Landmark (HC).

APPLICABLE CITY OF FORT WORTH ZONING ORINANCE PROVISIONS

4.401 Historic Preservation Overlay Districts

(c) Identification and Designation of Cultural Resources

3. Eligibility for Designation

   a. Eligibility for HC and HC District Designations.

   i. Individual Property. An individual property may be designation as HC if it meets the following qualifications:

   1. Two or more of the criteria for significance; and
   2. The necessary criteria for assessing integrity.

EVALUATION OF SIGNIFICANCE

The property at 212 S. Main Street is distinctive in character, interest and value, and exemplifies the cultural, economic, social, ethnic and historical heritage of the City of Fort Worth because it represents the evolution of architectural trends for small commercial buildings in Fort Worth from the Great Fire of April 3, 1909 to early post-World War II period (Criterion 1).

The property at 212 S. Main Street is an important example of the early 20th-century commercial style (Criterion 2). Built c. 1920, the structure is an excellent example of an early 20th-century masonry commercial building in Fort Worth. It is characterized by its red brick masonry walls; four bays on the front façade, featuring a character-defining recessed entrance; 1/1 double
hung windows; and decorative brick banding, brick detailing above windows, and blocks of cast stone.

The property at 212 S. Main Street is listed as a contributing structure to the South Main Street National Register Historic District (Criterion 8). As such, 212 S. Main Street bears a significant relationship to other distinctive buildings, structures, and the surrounding area as an important collection of properties of architectural style and craftsmanship with few intrusions, by contributing to the overall character of the South Main Street National Register District (Criterion 5). This group of properties is read as a cohesive unit that exemplifies the evolution of architectural trends for small commercial buildings in Fort Worth from the Great Fire of April 3, 1909 to early post-World War II period.

Located at the south end of the block, this two-story two-part Commercial Block building is constructed of red brick on the front (east) and south elevations. The rear (west) and north elevations are constructed of red brick that is of an inferior grade in comparison to the facades facing the streets, which is common among early 20th-century commercial buildings. The first floor of the facade is divided into four bays. The southern bay contains a recessed entrance, which is a unique character-defining feature of the building. The other bays have large display windows above brick bulkheads.

The second story has four single double-hung windows. Brick banding and blocks of cast stone are used as decorative detailing above windows, which is another unique character-defining feature of this structure, between the first and second stories and on the parapet. The north and south elevations have single double-hung windows on each floor (some windows are boarded over).

The building first housed the Franklin-Harris Motor Car Company. Other tenants included the Colonial Cake Company, a transfer and storage company, a Studebaker dealership and an appliance company. It is now home to Lone Star (formerly ABC) Banners and Flag Company.

EVALUATION OF INTEGRITY

Integrity is the ability of a property to convey its significance. The designation of a property must not only be shown to have significance under Zoning Ordinance, but it also must have integrity. Within the concept of integrity for example, the National Park Service criteria recognizes seven aspects that define integrity.

Seven Aspects of Integrity

1. Location.
2. Design.
5. Workmanship

Staff visited the property on January 25, 2019 to assess the integrity of the property.

The property conveys its significance because:
1. The structure is still in its original location on South Main Street.
2. The design of the structure is still intact and identifiable.
3. The structure is still within its original setting of small commercial buildings in the South Main Street National Register Historic District.
4. The property's original materials are still largely extant.
5. The property still displays the physical evidence of workmanship particular to the early 20th-century Commercial style, featuring red brick, minimal detailing, and decorative cast stone.
6. The property still retains its feeling as part of a group of small commercial buildings built in Fort Worth from the Great Fire of April 3, 1909 to early post-World War II period.
7. The property still retains its association with the growth of Fort Worth after the Great Fire of 1909 to the end of WWII.

It should be noted that some exterior alterations have taken place that have removed original materials, such as the bricking in of window openings and the painting of masonry. However, enough original fabric remains to inform the reinstatement of compatible new materials.

**FINDINGS / RECOMMENDATIONS**

**Eligibility for Designation**

The structure meets the following City of Fort Worth criteria for historic designation:

Criterion 1: Is distinctive in character, interest or value, and exemplifies the cultural, economic, social, ethnic or historical heritage of the City of Fort Worth, State of Texas or the United States.

Criterion 2: Is an important example of a particular architectural type or specimen or embodies elements of architectural design, detail, material, or craftsmanship that represent a significant architectural innovation in Fort Worth.

Criterion 5: Bears a significant relationship to other distinctive buildings, structures, sites, objects, or areas, either as an important collection of properties of architectural style or craftsmanship with few intrusions, or by contributing to the overall character of the area according to a plan based on architectural, historic, or cultural motif.

Criterion 8: Is designated as Recorded Texas Landmark or State Archeological Landmark or is included in the National Register of Historic Places.

**Integrity**

Based on the evidence still extant at the property, the property at 212 S. Main Street sufficiently retains seven aspects of integrity.

**Summary**

Staff have found evidence that the property meets 4 of the 8 Criteria for Designation. The property also retains its original integrity and the identity for which it is significant. This is consistent with the requirements of the ordinance for Historic and Cultural Landmark properties.

Therefore, staff recommends the following motion:
That the HCLC recommend that City Council consider changing the designation of 212 S. Main Street from Demolition Delay to Historic and Cultural Landmark (HC) and that the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties be used when evaluating any proposed future change to the property.
Supplemental Materials

Fig. 1 – Aerial

Fig. 2 – Deed card from 1938.
Fig. 3 – 1910-11 Sanborn Map, showing nothing on the future site of 212 S. Main Street.
Fig. 4 – 1951 Sanborn Map
Fig. 5 – Showing location of 212 S. Main Street in relation to South Main National Register Historic District.

Fig. 6 – Looking SW. Note difference in brick on front façade and side elevation.
Fig. 7 – Structure c.2010.

Fig. 7 – Looking NW. Note decorative brick banding, recessed corner entrance, 1/1 wood windows, and decorative cast stone.
Fig. 8 – Looking NE. Note boarded up windows, enclosed rear loading-bay entrance. Note some windows are blocked up with masonry.

Fig. 9 – Looking SE. Note boarded windows, differentiation between brick types, and capped parapet wall.
Fig. 11 – Structure c.1950. Note that the cast stone column bases are still extant on the property, but have been painted over. Also note the original storefronts and original 1/1 wood windows in all openings. The Standard Office Equipment sign has been removed.